

Teachers as Private Tutors: Understanding Dual Professional Identities of Six Faculty Members from Uzbekistan University

Andrey Khojiev

Abstract Due to socio-economic difficulties, many teachers in Uzbekistan combine their regular teaching activities with private supplementary tutoring (PST). Involvement in two professional activities has led to the emergence of teacher and tutor professional identities. It is assumed that the co-existence of dual identities has an influence on the professional activities of a tutor and/or of a teacher. Although a plethora of studies has focused on teacher identity and its effect on teachers' professional activities and some on co-existence of teacher identity with other social identities, there is a gap in the academic literature with only a few studies on teacher-tutor identity and its impact on their professional activities.

The present qualitative study has made an attempt to reveal the types of relationship between these two professional identities, to find out the reasons for the existing relationship and to explore how this relationship impacts their professional activities as a tutor and/or as a teacher. For these purposes, the research utilizes semi-structured interview questions with six university teaching staff members who are also private tutors. By applying a predetermined theoretical framework, an intrapersonal identity network approach, the study reveals the three most predominant types—power relationship, temporal and conflicting. These types of relationship found to have a negative impact on the respondents' activities as private tutors.

Keywords: shadow education, teacher identity, intrapersonal identity network approach, qualitative inquiry, uzbekistan.

Introduction

The Socio-Economic Drivers of PST in Uzbekistan and its Legal Status

PST, which is widely referred to as a “shadow education” because it mimics the curriculum of mainstream schooling, is the provision of tutoring in academic subjects outside regular school classes for financial gains (Bray, Kwo & Jokić, 2015). Being a market activity, PST is driven by the demand of the students and supply by the teachers/tutors. In Uzbekistan, a post-Soviet state in Central Asia, the students' demand for private classes has been conditioned by the poor quality of school education and highly competitive entrance exams to higher education institutions (HEIs), and the teachers' interests to supply this service have been aroused by their low wages. As in many countries, in Uzbekistan the legal status of PST as a market activity remains largely overlooked.

The poor quality of education at different school levels in Uzbekistan has been conditioned by several factors. The first factor is poor school facilities (United Nations Educational Scientific and Cultural Organization [UNESCO], 2019), which is the result of “severe funding shortage” from the central authority (Organization for Security and Cooperation in

Europe [OSCE], 2003, p. 29). With the collapse of the Soviet Union, the Uzbek economy has experienced downturn which negatively affected the inherited developed education system (OSCE, 2003; Asian Development Bank [ADB], 2010). The second factor is the shortage of qualified teachers (UNESCO, 2019), since the teaching profession has become one of the least attractive in Uzbekistan and in other former Soviet states. This is the result of the poor working conditions and heavy teaching workload (International Labor Rights Forum, 2012). Along with the low pupil-teacher ratio, the teacher shortage is observed in such subjects as English, IT and sciences (Global Partnership for Education, 2019). The final factor is poor pre-service teacher education (ADB, 2010). As a result, many Uzbekistan mainstream school teachers rely heavily on outdated teaching methods, which are largely inadequate to facilitate productive learning. Thus, the poor quality of school education has been one of the reasons driving students to turn to the service of PST.

The highly competitive HE entrance exams are the result of limited access to HE. This has been mainly conditioned by the underfunding from the Uzbekistan budget. According to the World Bank (2018), Uzbekistan's expenditure on higher education accounts for only 0.3 per cent of GDP and remains "one of the lowest in the world" (p. 24). This expenditure is insufficient to increase the number of academic staff members and to create sufficient facilities to accommodate the wider student population. The insufficient number of HEIs also limits access to education since it does not meet the demand of fast-growing young population. The current quota released by the central authority is capable to cover only 9 per cent of the overall young adult population (the World Bank, 2018). Lastly, the lack of access to HEIs can be explained by the non-transparent operation of Uzbek entrance exams (OSCE, 2016), which makes examinations tough for students to pass. All mentioned has led to more competitive entrance exams and become another reason for students to take PST classes.

The teachers' low salaries in Uzbekistan are the result of the "inadequately efficient distribution of the government funding for educational needs", which in turn can be explained by the "incomplete transition to progressive per capita system" (International Monetary Fund, 2008, p. 32). Although the teachers' wages within the primary secondary and tertiary levels have been increased significantly in the last few years (Global Partnership for Education, 2019), they are still insufficient either for rural or for urban residents due to the devolution rate of the Uzbek currency. The low wages have driven teachers to look for extra sources of income and PST has become the most popular option.

Being in great demand among the students and a popular option for extra sources of income among teachers, the status of PST remains largely overlooked in terms of regulations and/or legal stipulations. Neither educational nor legal regulations stipulate the special status of PST as a market activity. Tutors, however, can apply for a license of an individual entrepreneur to further pay taxes from their tutoring activities. To the author's knowledge, the application process for this kind of license remains rather dense, and thus, very rarely obtained by the tutors. The tutors are raided and penalized from time to time to get encouraged to get the license and pay taxes.

The Research Rationale and Aims

As discussed, in light of the country's socio-economic development and the ever-increasing phenomenon of PST, many Uzbekistan teachers tend to combine professional activities of a

teacher and of a private tutor. The combination of these activities has led to the emergence of their dual professional identities: a teacher and a private tutor. In the emergence of these two identities—one professional identity relates to another in a certain way. It is also assumed that the co-existence of dual identities has an influence on their professional activities of a tutor or of a teacher. Although a plethora of studies has focused on teacher identity and its effect on their professional activities (e.g., Beauchamp & Thomas, 2009; Buchanan, 2015; Franzak, 2002; Sachs, 2005) and some studies on co-existence of teacher identity with other social identities (e.g., Day, Kington, Stobart, & Sammons, 2006; Teng, 2019), there is a gap in academic literature with only few studies (e.g., Kobakhidze, 2018) on mixed teacher-tutor identity and its impact on their professional activities.

The present study is the pioneering attempt to investigate teacher-tutor identity in the context of Uzbekistan. Based on the narratives of six professionals who are engaged both in teaching activities as university lecturers and teaching activities as private tutors, the study aims at: a) finding the type of relationship(s) between teacher and tutor identities, b) revealing the reasons of the existing relationship(s); c) exploring how dual professional identities and the relationship(s) between them impact on their activities as teachers or/and as private tutors. The findings of the present study are anticipated to partially cover the existing gap in the academic literature and to provide some guidance for future research in the field of dual teacher identities and PST in the context of Uzbekistan or elsewhere.

Literature Review

Shadow Education and the Emergence of a New Profession

The PST is a globally fast-growing phenomenon going hand in hand with the mainstream form of schooling (e.g., Aurini, 2013; Kobakhidze, 2014; Silova, 2010; Zhang & Bray, 2016). The metaphoric reference to PST as to “shadow education” has been well established in academic literature since the 90 s of the last century (Yung & Bray, 2017). According to the definition proposed by Bray (1999), shadow education can be characterized within three main dimensions: 1) supplementation—shadow education adds on school curriculum and is delivered outside the regular school hours; 2) privateness—the tutors provide classes for financial reward; 3) academic subjects—the scope of tutoring classes is limited to the subjects taught at mainstream schools (e.g., languages, mathematics, mother tongue and others). PST is found to be widely spread both in economically developed and less developed nations with the diverse socio-economic backgrounds (Silova, 2009).

This phenomenon has received the most attention in Asia Pacific region (*see* Bray, 2013; Bray, Kobakhidze, Zhang, & Liu, 2018; Liu & Bray, 2017; Mahmud & Bray, 2017; Teo & Koh, 2019; Yamato & Zhang, 2017; Zhang, Bray, Wang, Lykins, & Kwo, 2013). There are only a few studies conducted in the post-Soviet discourse and Central Asia (i.e., Kazakhstan, Tajikistan and Kyrgyzstan) in particular (e.g., Silova; 2009; Silova; 2010). In post-Soviet states, shadow education has arisen with a number of opportunities and challenges. One of the opportunities is that parents have viewed PST as an effective means to help their children to adapt to the new socio-economic environment (Silova, 2009). While after the collapse of the Soviet Union the school systems experienced downfall not getting promptly reorganized to

meet the demands of the independent states, the PST has provided assistance to students due to its “efficient, flexible and prompt” nature (Silova, 2009, p. 328). At the same time, shadow education in post-socialist states as elsewhere has given rise to the issues of social inequality, corruption, increased students’ workload, leakage of taxes and a shift in public school curricula (Silova & Bray, 2006). In her study, Silova (2009) outlines socio-political changes that gave rise to the PST after the collapse of the Soviet Union. These changes include reduction of the funds spent by the state on education, decline in education quality at public schools, increased demand for tertiary education and shifted status of teaching professions. The latter fact is of paramount interest for the present study since together with the external shift of social status, the teachers had to alter their internal identity adopting a new profession of private tutors. The co-existence of both professional identities has not been yet investigated in the context of Central Asia.

The Concept of Teacher and Teacher-Tutor Identities

The concept of identity is a complex multidimensional phenomenon and its investigation varies in methods across different disciplines including psychology, philosophy, sociology, anthropology and sociolinguistics (Beauchamp & Thomas, 2009). In the educational studies, the concept of teacher identity (TI) is of particular interest since its investigation allows to facilitate productive learning by accommodating both teachers and their students’ needs.

There are a number of definitions formulated in the attempt to explore TI from various angles. For example, Gee (2000) describes it as a type of personality in a certain discourse. The discourse may include “the intersection of personal, pedagogical, and political participation and reflection within a larger sociopolitical context” (Hoffman-Kipp, 2008, p. 153). Olsen (2008) defines identity as a “collection of influences and effects from immediate contexts, prior constructs of self, social positioning, and meaning systems” (p. 139). Indeed, there is a wide range of contextual factors that shape the identity of teachers (Beauchamp & Thomas, 2009), may it be their personal education experience, relationship with their present colleagues, a number of teaching hours, involvement in extracurricular activities or a combination of all. As a result, identity turns out to be a “resource that people use to explain, justify and make sense of themselves in relation to others, and to the world at large” (Mac Lure, 1993, p. 311). In this way, TI is a frame within which they “construct their own ideas of ‘how to be’, ‘how to act’ and ‘how to understand’ their work and their place in society” (Sachs, 2005, p. 15). At the same time TI is fluid and changeable throughout teachers’ development in personal and professional life (Beijaard, Meijer, & Verloop, 2004; Beauchamp & Thomas, 2009). The professional experience that characterizes TI is well-investigated through the teachers’ personal narratives about their past, present and future that reveal “their own agency ...[and] their own strongly held views of themselves as teachers” (Bar-khuizen, 2016, p. 7).

The teacher identity is known to co-exist with other professional identities. This co-existence happens “at the given time and context” with other “core identities”, which guide teachers’ activities (Teng, 2019, p. 84). When teacher identity co-exists with other professional identities, the realization of the former identity depends on individual’s values and larger contextual factors. In this way, in order to reveal more comprehensive insights regarding one’s professional experience and activities, it is important to explore multiple core

professional identities (Day et al., 2006). In case of the present research, the two professional identities—the teacher and the tutor—can be considered as core identities that will largely direct the activities of the research participants.

The research that focuses on the identities of PST providers remain largely scarce in academic literature with only few studies done on either tutor identity or on correlation of both teacher and tutor identities (Popa, 2007; Xiong et al., 2020; Yung & Yuan, 2018). This phenomenon has received even less attention in post-Soviet discourse. The most in-depth research on mixed teacher-tutor identities has been conducted by Kobakhidze (2018) in the context of Georgia, where as well as in many other post-Soviet states, teachers have to adopt “entrepreneurial identities to survive economically” (p.114). In her work, along with her other findings, Kobakhidze (2018) provides insights on how teachers from mainstream education perceive their role of a tutor, and on how the co-existence of both professional identities affect their professional commitments. Although the teacher identity was perceived separately from the tutor identity, the co-existence of dual professional identities has a “high degree of interdependence”, where the identity of a teacher was prioritized over the identity of a tutor due to the latter identity to be “self- imposed” rather than “chosen” (Kobakhidze, 2018, p.115). As the findings suggest, teachers find it difficult to adopt the tutor’s role because of their moral values since the former role has more to deal with the teaching for the common good and the latter role is associated with teaching for personal profit making. The contradicting values of the teacher identity versus the tutor identity have been found to be reflected on their professional activities, where teacher-tutors have to “compromise” on their time and energy devoted to each role “in a given time” (Kobakhidze, 2018, p.119).

Theoretical Framework: Intrapersonal Identity Network Approach

There are a number of approaches arisen from various paradigms to analyze the concept of multiple or dual identities. Although the approaches vary greatly depending on the nature of inquiry, the multiple or dual identities have been primarily studied from socio-psychological (e.g., Briley, Morris, & Simonson, 2005; Hogg & Terry, 2000), microsociological (e.g., Burke & Stets, 2009; Stryker & Burke, 2000), psychodynamic (e.g., Leary & Tangney, 2003; Morf & Rhodewalt, 2001), critical (e.g., Alvesson, 2001; Alvesson & Willmott, 2002) and intersectional (e.g., Acker, 2006; Ferree, 2009) perspectives. The present research adopts an intrapersonal identity network approach as a theoretical framework for investigation. Being proposed by Ramarajan (2014), this novel and comprehensive framework embodies the major assumptions of the mentioned approaches, and thus, allows to investigate the concept of dual professional identities from the multifarious perspectives.

Since an intrapersonal identity network approach is a “broad and flexible framework” to meet different research objectives on identities (Ramarajan, 2014, p. 619), an attempt is made to adjust major of its constituents pertinent to the present inquiry. First, the framework presumes the *nodes* of the network which are represented by various identities. The number of these nodes will depend on “the number of identities relevant to the scholar’s research question” (Ramarajan, 2014, p. 621). In other words, our study will consider two identities: teacher and tutor as the nodes of the network. Second, the nodes are assumed to differently relate to each other. The different relationship between the nodes are called *ties*. Third and the most important, intrapersonal identity network approach suggests the ties to be of different

types. The following gives a brief account of the ties or the types of relationships among/between multiple/dual identities from the analysis by Ramarajan (2014, pp. 613–623), thus the one’s multiple/dual identity may:

- *Conflict* with one another. This conflict is caused by the “conflicting standards” between or among “work or non-work identities” due to the one’s feeling of non-satisfactory performance;
- *Enhance* each other’s experience. This enhancement or identity synergy happens if the activities of one identity benefit from the “skills, knowledge ...resources” of another identity;
- *Integrate* into one another. The integration or overlap of the identities happens if their interests, values or beliefs belong to the similar “system of meanings”;
- Come into *power relationships*. If this type of tie emerges, the one identity is prioritized over another. The prioritization of a certain identity depends on the “status and power” that it denotes in society;
- Come into *temporal ties*. The temporal relationship between the identities happens when an individual progresses through their professional life and intends to shift from one professional identity to another. The identity, which is intended to be shifted, is in the temporal ties with other core identities;
- Come into *multiplex ties*. This complex tie is sought to detonate “many different types of ties between the same two nodes”. It is presumed that two and the same identities may simultaneously have different relationships between each other. For example, the nodes can come in conflict for some reasons as much as they can enhance each other for another reasons.

The type of the relationships (ties) between the identities (nodes) have been found to impact profoundly one’s professional and non-professional activities (Ramarajan, 2014). With this assumption, the present research also attempts to reveal which of the mentioned ties exist between teacher and tutor identities and how these ties impact their professional activities.

Research Methodology

Research Method and Research Questions

The semi-structured, individual interviews, as a qualitative research method, were adopted in the present study. The use of semi-structured interviews enabled the researcher to attain in-depth descriptive data to characterize the two mentioned domains—the teacher’s and the tutor’s one. In particular, twelve prepared open-ended interview questions were sought to facilitate the research participants’ (RPs’) narratives on the implicit and explicit representation of their professional identities, the relationship between identities, the reasons for this relationship and the impact of this relationship on their professional activities. The gathered data was anticipated to contribute to the following research questions:

1. What are the relationship(s) between the teacher and the tutor identities?
2. What are the reasons for the existing relationship(s)?

3. How does the existing relationship(s) between two professional identities impact the teacher and/or the tutor activities?

Before collecting the data, the author has undergone the ethical review process and obtained ethical approval from the independent ethics committee. The interview questions were piloted with two research participants who worked for the same Uzbekistan university as the main participants do. The pilot interviews have informed the present study interviews in the sense that the researcher could formulate more precise follow-up questions. The RPs were invited to sign a consent form online and have been informed about their right to withdraw from the interview any time without any negative consequences. They were also introduced to the aim of the present research. The questions related to the personal issues of the research participants were avoided. Each interview lasted 40–50 minutes per each RR. Since the researcher was not in the country where the research was conducted—the interviews were held via Zoom. There were no particular challenges in collecting the data online, since the researcher knew every research participant in person by his previous affiliations. Due to the RPs' proficient command of the language, the questions have been designed and employed in English. The RPs were reassured that their names and the name of the institution they work for will be kept confidential, which facilitated more in-depth data during the interview from the participants regarding the perception of their professional activities.

Research Participants and Sampling

Since the research focus is on the RPs' activities partially related to the shadow education, which represents some methodological inconvenience (i. e., shadow education stakeholders may be unwilling to participate in research in case it is regarded as an illegitimate form of education) (Coniam, 2014; Bray, Kwo & Jokić, 2015), the nonprobability convenience sampling method was employed. This sampling method allowed to select those respondents who found the research objectives “convenient” and expressed their “availability” (Salkind, 2010, p. 254). The researcher approached all the known, by the previous affiliations, university teachers who also worked as private tutors and asked about their availability. Among respondents who expressed their interest, the RPs were chosen based on two selection criteria. Firstly, potential RPs should have had relatively solid and comparable work experience in both professions. The sufficient time spent in the professions is assumed to construct their dual professional identities to a considerable extent. Secondly, the potential RPs should have been recognized in both professions. In Uzbekistan the most demanded and highly qualified professionals are hired by universities. The fact that they work for universities make them popular among potential tutees.

Thus six RPs were chosen for the present study (*Table 1*). All of them had more than five years of working experience as teachers at one of Uzbekistan universities. They also worked as private tutors of General English (GE), International English Language Testing System (IELTS) and/or Test of English as a Foreign Language (TOEFL) preparation. All of them hold post-graduate degrees from foreign institutions, are highly ranked among their students at university as lecturers and are of reasonable demand as tutors. The participants worked on average 12 contact hours per week as teachers at university and 8 hours per week as private tutors.

Table 1. Research Participant Profiles

Title Code	Accumulative years of work experience	Taught level(s) (L) as a University Teacher (UT) and taught courses as a Private Tutor (PT)
Teacher-Tutor 1 TT1	Teacher: 8 Tutor: 8	UT: L3, L4 PT: IELTS, GE
Teacher-Tutor 2 TT2	Teacher: 7 Tutor: 9	UT: L3, L7 PT: IELTS, GE
Teacher-Tutor 3 TT3	Teacher: 7 Tutor: 5	UT: L3 PT: TOEFL, IELTS
Teacher-Tutor 4 TT4	Teacher: 21 Tutor: 20	UT: L4 PT: IELTS, GE
Teacher-Tutor 5 TT5	Teacher: 22 Tutor: 24	UT: L4 PT: GE, IELTS
Teacher-Tutor 6 TT6	Teacher: 20 Tutor: 22	UT: L3, L4, L5 PT: IELTS; GE

It is important to mention that university lecturer usually combines at least two professional identities—the identity of a researcher and the identity of a teacher. The present study hereafter is to focus on their identity and the activity of a teacher. In other words, the respondents’ university teaching activities and private tutoring activities, and corresponding identities will only be examined.

Data Analysis

The content analysis was applied for the collected data. This “flexible” approach allows to analyze “narrative responses” within “explicit” and “inferred” communication means to further categorize them based on the meaning and the relationship between certain concepts or themes (Hsieh & Shannon, 2005, p. 1278). Being guided by predetermined theoretical framework—an Intrapersonal Identity Network Approach, the researcher applied the deductive approach to reveal both explicit and implicit representation of ties (relationships) between the nodes (identities) using the principles of selective coding. That is, the type of ties (e.g., conflicting, integrating, temporal, power relation) proposed by an Interpersonal Identity Network Approach served as initial resultant themes. The researcher then looked at the evidence of the presence and the non-presence of these themes in the transcripts of the interviews. Having found the presence of certain themes, the author further looked for the evidence of how these themes (ties) relate to one another, and how the relationship between/

among the themes affects the respondents' professional activities. The findings were organized based on the presence of the evidence of the certain ties between the two professional identities and their impact on either teacher's or tutor's activities.

Findings

Multiplex Ties: Power Relationship – Temporal – Conflicting

All six respondents indicated multiplex ties between teacher and tutor professional identities. They all reported three most distinctive ones among these multiple ties. The first tie is power relationship, where the teacher identity is prioritized over the tutor identity:

TT2: I prioritize my official work over my tutoring. ... I don't like a status of a tutor, if I had an opportunity in my life not to do tutoring – I wouldn't do it. If I had a higher status at the University, and if my university paid me more than it pays me now I would never ever go for tutoring.

TT6: When I got a job at the University, the salary was not rewarding and I had to start a side job. So private tutoring is like a side job.

The second is a temporal tie, where the identity of the private tutor was indicated to be in temporal relation to the identity of university teacher:

TT1: Tutoring is not something, I see doing for my life, while university teaching is something, I will go with throughout all my life.

TT3: Private tutoring is not a career; it is just for the time being.

TT6: Soon, I will stop private tutoring at all, and will start fully devoting myself to my university job.

The third is a conflict tie. In this type of relationship, the tutor identity comes in conflict with the teacher identity:

TT2: So, I do not like tutoring, because I do not like myself in tutoring, myself as a teacher in tutoring. ... My university persona is very different from my tutoring persona.

Reasons for Existing Relationships

There are a number of reasons that have been found to cause the mentioned ties between the teacher and the tutor identities. Those above are the most commonly stated. The power relationship between the teacher and the tutor identities has been mainly established because of opportunities for career/professional growth, social status/benefits and collegial support that the former identity offers. While the latter identity is found to be less prestigious and to provide less stable income:

TT1: Work at university seems to be carrying more prestige than being a tutor.

TT2: [University job] is not only the professional development, ...[but] also establishment of yourself in the field.

TT3: University teaching is much more rewarding, especially for the professional development because you have more students there. And you can conduct action research to understand the classroom problems.

TT5: ... another reason can be an official record of my work, ...[so] I can be sure that my experience is going on. And after sometime when I retire, I know that I will get a pension. Whereas working at home doesn't offer this security.

TT4: I really like the colleagues [at University] I work with. I think if there were not my colleagues, I wouldn't enjoy my work. The atmosphere is really much important.

TT6: Private market has never been stable, because you may have students at a certain time and you may not have any in other times. So, what you need actually is to concentrate on a more stable and a more secure job. In this regard, I find a university job as more secure and safe.

The most stated reason for a private tutoring to be a temporal profession is due to its financial reward. So, the RPs intend to quit it because they currently have enough gained professional expertise and growth to get a higher income in their regular activities:

TT1: Tutoring is done in Uzbekistan ...because of the financial reasons. But I have a chance not to do tutoring [because my] salary has gone up significantly since I was promoted. And I think that in the future, hopefully, I will stop doing it altogether.

TT6: I would rather work with more professionals because I have now more or less the expertise that I can share in the field of education, in the field of assessment and curriculum development. ...I would rather work with more professionals... than just working with private tutees.

TT4: I have done private tutoring to make money nothing more. Now I'm not really concerned about it, since I have made most of the biggest purchases. Now I feel I have enough credential to start my PhD research.

The conflict tie among the identities has been established because the tutor activities contradict the teacher identity's professional values and beliefs, limit their creativity and push to violate the laws:

TT5: Tutoring is a customer-service relationship that should not really be a case in teaching, to satisfy your client. ... There were cases when students did not study, but I had to carry on because they were paying.

TT1: I do not really feel that there is a lot of space for my creativity [in private tutoring]. ... it is very limiting when a student has the purpose of only entering a university... [So] there is not a lot of things that you can really do during the classes.

TT2: What we do is not official and you always work under a constant pressure of being caught, of being reported, of being told by someone that you are doing private tutoring in your home. ... I also see a big problem in the material that we use. ... I cannot really go and buy them – I download them from the internet illegally – it could break the copy right and it is not okay.

TT1: This area is hidden. So, lots of tutors are working illegally... Throughout these years there have been three or four times when lots of tutors were caught. ... I am not particularly happy with this situation, because I consider myself to be a person with high ethical standards.

Impact of the Relationships on Professional Activities

The most commonly stated, by RPs who have indicated this chain of ties, was an impact on their tutoring classes. In particular, they reported fulfilling their university responsibilities at

the expense of their private classes. As a result, the respondents felt the decrease in the quality of the private tutoring classes due to the frequent cancelation and being not fully committed:

TT1: [Private tutoring] turns almost like a factory ...just a conveyer of students, which at some point means that there is no quality. ... What happens is that you do not have time to prepare. You end up teaching students the same stuff.

TT2: When there is a lot of money involved, I feel that for the money I am paid I need to do as much as I am paid for. And sometimes in my practice it happened that I felt that I didn't really earn that twenty dollars in one hour and thirty minutes, because I didn't do much—I only printed new material and I only asked the right questions. ... Private tutoring is like a conveyer.

TT4: With private tutoring you feel like a money-making machine. And it is well reflected on the quality of your tutoring classes.

TT5: If there is a requirement that I have to be at University, there was oftentimes when I had to cancel my private classes.

TT1: I felt very unhappy ...that I had to cancel the [tutoring] classes a lot because I had some responsibilities to fulfill at university.

TT6: [Private tutoring] is quite a tiring job...because you sit with people most of the time one to one and it is not easy. I feel I am not fully committed during these classes and that's way the quality of the lessons suffers...

Discussion

By employing an intrapersonal identity network approach as a theoretical framework for present investigation, the findings of the study echo and supplement the assumptions of the multiple disciplines that this framework was built on. In particular, the obtained results are in line with the socio-psychological, micro-sociological, developmental and critical perspectives on multiple/dual professional identities and the relationship between/among them. The present research results are also in line with and supplement some of the findings from previous study on mixed teacher-tutor identity.

The findings that multiple identities are in the power relationship, where one identity is prioritized over another, reflect some assumptions of social identity and identity theories. These theories employed by socio-psychological and micro-sociological approaches presume multiple identities to be structured in hierarchy (Hogg, Terry, & White, 1995; Stets & Burke, 2003; Tajfel, 1978). In the hierarchical relationship, along with other reasons a single identity turns salient or "rises to the top of hierarchy" owing to its "strength" (Ramarajan, 2014, pp. 595–599; Hornung, Bandelow, & Vogeler, 2018 p. 2014; Korte, 2007). As the present research shows the strength of the professional identity is determined by the social status it denotes and the resources it accumulates. In other words, the respondents prioritized their teacher identity over their tutor identity because they assume the regular teaching profession to possess a higher social status, to bring a more stable income and to provide more resources in favor of professional development than the private tutoring profession does. The organizational research using a micro-sociological perspective have shown that hierarchical relationship of multiple identities presumes "hierarchy of commitments in this relationship"

(Ramarajan, 2014, p. 598). That is, the extent that one will affirm commitments to the responsibilities of one professional identity over another will depend on the degree of salience of this identity in the hierarchy. As the present research indicates this extent may be determined by fulfilling the responsibilities of salient identity (i. e., teacher) at the expense of the responsibilities of non- salient identity (i. e., tutor).

The findings that identities may have temporal ties echo some assumptions of the developmental approach to dual identities. This approach studies the concept of identity as an evolutionary phenomenon which is unfolded or displaced within the life span (Phinney, 1993; Ganiere & Enright, 1989; Moen, 2003). The identity, which is being displaced, is entitled to have a temporal tie. Organizational scholars studying the multiple identities using developmental approach have suggested that one would unfold or displace professional identity depending on contextual factors facilitating professional growth (Higgins & Thomas, 2001). The latter is reflected in the present research results, where respondents indicated professional growth within regular university activities and a consequent increase of their income as the main factor of displacing tutor identity. The temporal tie of the identity is known to “motivate [one’s] actions in present” (Ramarajan, 2014, p. 623). In other words, one may be less inclined to contribute to the activities of that professional identity which is assumed to be displaced. This may be another explanation of why the respondents constantly cancelled their private tutoring classes and felt the decrease in the quality of their teaching.

The findings that dual identities may come in conflict relationship reflect the assumption of all abovementioned disciplines. Although these disciplines employ different approaches to studying relationships between multiple/dual identities, they generally agree on the point that two or more identities come in conflict due to the contradicting values of one identity to others (Brook, Garcia, & Fleming, 2008; Gocłowska & Crisp, 2014; Settle, 2004). Even though not explicitly, the respondents of the present research mentioned that their core teacher identity value to advance themselves as professionals for the benefits of their students contradicts the core tutor identity value to work for the benefits of themselves. Another indicated conflict is between their citizen identity that abides by the laws with their tutor identity that violates the laws. The conflict between the identities is found to be projected onto the “performance of one or both of these identities” (Jones & Hynie, 2017, p. 2). In the present study, this projection is revealed to be on the activities that correspond to one professional identity. In other words, due to the conflict tie between tutor and teacher identities, the activities of the former were reported to be of poor quality. Finally, the conflicting tie is assumed to cause an internal tension, since the “set of meanings, values, and behaviors” of one identity do not “satisfy... expectations” of another identity (Ramarajan, 2014, p. 614). This is found to be a case with the present RPs who admitted being emotionally strained, since the high standards that their teacher identity is striving for in professional activities are not maintained in the activities corresponding to the tutor identity.

The findings of the present study correspond with the findings of the previous study on teacher-tutor identity conducted by Kobakhidze (2018). In particular, teacher-tutors from the previous study valued their teacher role more due to its higher social status, and the moral aspect attached to this role. Another explanation of teacher identity to possess more value than the tutor identity in previous research is that later identity is usually self-imposed because of the teachers’ financial needs. The present research participants have also indicated that they are involved in tutoring because of the financial gains rather than professional interests. As in the previous, the research participants in the present study indicated the conflict between their

dual professional identities. The study by Kobakhidze (2018) found that the conflict between two professional roles happen because teacher-tutors have to fulfill the responsibilities of one profession at the expense of another. The present study complements these findings and further indicates that the conflict between the professional roles is the result of the conflict between the core identities, which leads to the fulfilling the responsibilities of one professional identity at the expense of another. However, unlike the study by Kobakhidze (2018) which indicated that both teachers' and tutors' activities may be impacted depending on the importance of each role in a given time, the present study indicated that only the activities corresponding to the tutor's identities are negatively affected.

Conclusions and Further Directions

Private supplementary tutoring has been found to contribute to the social inequality as students from the disadvantaged backgrounds are deprived of the quality education to further progress in life. The tutors as the providers of this service are partly involved in promoting such inequality. In the given situation, only a few studies considered the motives driving teachers to become tutors, and most importantly, how the values and beliefs of both identities co-exist and are projected on their professional activities. The present study was a pioneering attempt in the discourse of Uzbekistan to shed light on this issue. In particular, within the intrapersonal identity network approach it aimed to reveal the types of relationship between tutor and teacher identities, to find out the reasons for existing types of the relationship and to identify the possible impact of each type on respondents' professional activities. The study reveals three most predominant types: power relationship, temporal and conflicting. The reason for power relationship, where the teacher identity is prioritized over the tutor identity, is the social status and a more stable income that the former identity denotes. The reason for the temporal relationship is the professional growth of the respondents and the inability of the tutor identity to meet their professional interests. The reason for conflicting relationship is contradicting values and beliefs of both identities. As a result, the power relationship and the temporal tie between the identities found to have led to the constant cancellation of the tutoring classes, and the conflicting tie reported to have led to decreased quality of PST service. Although not explicitly, the findings point out to the tension that teacher-tutors experience, which is the result of their conflicting professional values.

The present study has some limitations which are important to consider for the further research. Firstly, study has only investigated the intersection of two core identities—the teacher's and the tutor's ones. The professionals at university and elsewhere, however, are assumed to have more than two core identities (e.g., social: citizen identity, professional: researcher identity). Thus, the investigation of other core identities and their intersection with the two mentioned ones may present deeper insight into professionals' feelings, motives and activities. Secondly, the involvement of more research participants and increasing the research sample size are important to reveal the general trends. Since the present research is exploratory and as such involved small sample size of the research participants, it is not possible to generalize the obtained results. Thirdly, the verification of the research results needs to be considered in further studies. The present results indicated the decrease in quality of tutoring

classes; however, this decrease is indicated only by the perceptions of the research participants. The further research should apply the means to verify the actual impact of dual or multiple professional identities and their conflicting values on regular teaching and tutoring classes. Finally, the analysis of the existing country's policies is important to introduce PST as legally stipulated activity. In the present exploratory study, it has been found that teacher-tutors experience certain tension which is partially related to their feelings of being involved in illegitimate activities. The policies that will regard PST as a legal activity are assumed to mitigate tutors' tension and contribute to the quality of their classes.

References

- Acker, J. (2006). Inequality Regimes. *Gender & Society*, 20(4), 441–464. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0891243206289499>
- Alvesson, M. (2001). Knowledge Work: Ambiguity, Image and Identity. *Human Relations*, 54(7), 863–886. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0018726701547004>
- Alvesson, M., & Willmott, H. (2002). Identity Regulation as Organizational Control: Producing the Appropriate Individual. *Journal of Management Studies*, 39(5), 619–644. <https://doi.org/10.1111/1467-6486.00305>
- Asian Development Bank. (2010). *ADB Evaluation Study. Uzbekistan Education*. Retrieved from <https://www.oecd.org/countries/uzbekistan/47178666.pdf>
- Aurini, J. (2013). *Out of the Shadows: The Global Intensification of Supplementary Education*. Emerald Group Publishing.
- Barkhuizen, G. (2016). *Reflections on Language Teacher Identity Research*. Taylor & Francis
- Beauchamp, C., & Thomas, L. (2009). Understanding teacher identity: an overview of issues in the literature and implications for teacher education. *Cambridge Journal of Education*, 39(2), 175–189. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03057640902902252>
- Beijaard, D., Meijer, P. C., & Verloop, N. (2004). Reconsidering research on teachers' professional identity. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 20(2), 107–128. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2003.07.001>
- Brook, A. T., Garcia, J., & Fleming, M. A. (2008). The Effects of Multiple Identities on Psychological Well-Being. *Personality and Social Psychology Bulletin*, 34(12), 1588–1600. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0146167208324629>
- Bray, M. (1999). *The shadow education system: Private tutoring and its implications for planners*. Paris: UNESCO International Institute for Educational Planning
- Bray, M. (2009). *Confronting the shadow education system: What government policies for what private tutoring?* Paris: UNESCO International Institute for Educational Planning
- Bray, M. (2013). Benefits and Tensions of Shadow Education: Comparative Perspectives on the Roles and Impact of Private Supplementary Tutoring in the Lives of Hong Kong Students. *Journal of International and Comparative Education*, 2(1), 18–30. <https://doi.org/10.14425/00.45.72>
- Bray, M., Kobakhidze, M. N., Zhang, W., & Liu, J. (2018). The hidden curriculum in a hidden marketplace: relationships and values in Cambodia's shadow education system. *Journal of Curriculum Studies*, 50(4), 435–455. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00220272.2018.1461932>
- Bray, M., Kwo, O., & Jokić, B. (2016). *Researching Private Supplementary Tutoring: Methodological Lessons from Diverse Cultures (CERC Studies in Comparative Education (32))* (1st ed. 2016 ed.). Springer.

- Briley, D. A., Morris, M. W., & Simonson, I. (2005). Cultural Chameleons: Biculturals, Conformity Motives, and Decision Making. *Journal of Consumer Psychology, 15*(4), 351–362. https://doi.org/10.1207/s15327663jcp1504_9
- Buchanan, R. (2015). Teacher identity and agency in an era of accountability. *Teachers and Teaching, 21*(6), 700–719. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13540602.2015.1044329>
- Burke, P. J., & Stets, J. E. (2009). *Identity Theory* (Illustrated ed.). Oxford University Press.
- Coniam, D. (2013). Private Tutorial Schools in Hong Kong: An Examination of the Perceptions of Public Examination Re-takers. *The Asia-Pacific Education Researcher, 23*(3), 379–388. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s40299-013-0113-x>
- Day, C., Kington, A., Stobart, G., & Sammons, P. (2006). The personal and professional selves of teachers: stable and unstable identities. *British Educational Research Journal, 32*(4), 601–616. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01411920600775316>
- Ferree, M. M. (2009). *Inequality, intersectionality and the politics of discourse*. In E. Lombardo, P. Meier, & M. Verloo (Eds.), *The discursive politics of gender equality* (pp. 86–104). Routledge
- Franzak, J. (2002). Developing a Teacher Identity: The Impact of Critical Friends Practice on the Student Teacher. *English Education, 34*(4), 258–280
- Ganire, D. M., & Enright, R. D. (1988). Exploring three approaches to identity development. *Journal of Youth and Adolescence, 18*(3), 283–295. <https://doi.org/10.1007/bf02139042>
- Gocłowska, M. I. A., & Crisp, R. J. (2014). How Dual-Identity Processes Foster Creativity. *Review of General Psychology, 18*(3), 216–236. <https://doi.org/10.1037/gpr0000008>
- Gee, J. P. (2000). Identity as an Analytic Lens for Research in Education. *Review of Research in Education, 25*, 99. <https://doi.org/10.2307/1167322>
- Global Partnership for Education. (2019). *Education sector plan 2019–2023. Uzbekistan*. Retrieved from <https://www.globalpartnership.org/content/education-sector-plan-2019-2023-uzbekistan>
- Higgins, M. C., & Thomas, D. A. (2001). Constellations and careers: toward understanding the effects of multiple developmental relationships. *Journal of Organizational Behavior, 22*(3), 223–247. <https://doi.org/10.1002/job.66>
- Hogg, M. A., & Terry, D. I. (2000). Social Identity and Self-Categorization Processes in Organizational Contexts. *Academy of Management Review, 25*(1), 121–140. <https://doi.org/10.5465/amr.2000.2791606>
- Hogg, M. A., Terry, D. J., & White, K. M. (1995). A Tale of Two Theories: A Critical Comparison of Identity Theory with Social Identity Theory. *Social Psychology Quarterly, 58*(4), 255. <https://doi.org/10.2307/2787127>
- Hornung, J., Bandelow, N. C., & Vogeler, C. S. (2018). Social identities in the policy process. *Policy Sciences, 52*(2), 211–231. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11077-018-9340-6>
- Hsieh, H.-F., & Shannon, S.E. (2005). Three Approaches to Qualitative Content Analysis. *Qualitative Health Research, 15*(9), 1277–1288. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1049732305276687>
- International Labor Rights Forum. (2012). *Teachers in Uzbekistan: Deprived of their Profession. Forced to be Cotton Growers*. Retrieved from <http://www.cottoncampaign.org/blog/teachers-in-uzbekistan-deprived-of-their-profession-forced-to-be-cotton-growers>
- International Monetary Fund. (2008). *Republic of Uzbekistan: Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper*. Washington D.C.: International Monetary Fund
- Jones, J. M., & Hynie, M. (2017). Similarly Torn, Differentially Shorn? The Experience and Management of Conflict between Multiple Roles, Relationships, and Social Categories. *Frontiers in Psychology, 8*, <https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2017.01732>
- Kobakhidze, M. N. (2014). Corruption risks of private tutoring: case of Georgia. *Asia Pacific Journal of Education, 34*(4), 455–475. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02188791.2014.963506>
- Kobakhidze, M. N. (2018). *Teachers as Tutors: Shadow Education Market Dynamics in Georgia (CERC Studies in Comparative Education (34))* (1st ed. 2018 ed.). Springer.

- Korte, R. F. (2007). A review of social identity theory with implications for training and development. *Journal of European Industrial Training*, 31(3), 166–180. <https://doi.org/10.1108/03090590710739250>
- Kwo, O., & Bray, M. (2014). Understanding the nexus between mainstream schooling and private supplementary tutoring: patterns and voices of Hong Kong secondary students. *Asia Pacific Journal of Education*, 34(4), 403–416. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02188791.2014.961900>
- Leary, M. R., & Tangney, J. P. (2003). *The self as an organizing construct in the behavioral and social sciences*. In M. R. Leary & J. P. Tangney (Eds.), *Handbook of self and identity* (p. 3–14). New York: Guilford Press
- Liu, J., & Bray, M. (2016). Determinants of demand for private supplementary tutoring in China: findings from a national survey. *Education Economics*, 25(2), 205–218. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09645292.2016.1182623>
- Mahmud, R., & Bray, M. (2017). School factors underlying demand for private supplementary tutoring in English: urban and rural variations in Bangladesh. *Asia Pacific Journal of Education*, 37(3), 299–309. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02188791.2017.1321525>
- Moen, P. (2003). *It's about Time: Couples and Careers* (Illustrated ed.). ILR Press
- Morf, C. C., & Rhodewalt, F. (2001). Unraveling the Paradoxes of Narcissism: A Dynamic Self-Regulatory Processing Model. *Psychological Inquiry*, 12(4), 177–196. https://doi.org/10.1207/s15327965pli1204_1
- Olsen, B. (2008). *Teaching What They Learn, Learning What They Live: How Teachers' Personal Histories Shape Their Professional Development*. Routledge.
- Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe [OSCE]. (2003). Current education issues in Central Asia. A background paper from the conflict prevention center 2003. Retrieved from <https://www.osce.org/files/f/documents/9/d/39626.pdf>
- Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe [OSCE]. (2016). Corruption in Uzbek Higher Education: Detrimental Impurity for the Future. Retrieved from <http://osce-academy.net/upload/file/Brief34.pdf>
- Phinney, J. S. (1993). Multiple group identities: Differentiation, conflict, and integration. In J. Kroger (Ed.), *Discussions on ego identity* (pp. 47–73). Hillsdale, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum
- Popa, S. (2007). *Defensible spaces: Ideologies of professionalism and teachers' work in the Romanian private tutoring system*. PhD dissertation. University of Pittsburgh.
- Ramarajan, L. (2014). Past, Present and Future Research on Multiple Identities: Toward an Intrapersonal Network Approach. *The Academy of Management Annals*, 8(1), 589–659. <https://doi.org/10.1080/19416520.2014.912379>
- Sachs, J. (2001). Teacher professional identity: competing discourses, competing outcomes. *Journal of Education Policy*, 16(2), 149–161. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02680930116819>
- Sachs, J. (2005). Teacher education and the development of professional identity: Learning to be a teacher. In P. Denicolo & M. Kompf (Eds.), *Connecting policy and practice: Challenges for teaching and learning in schools and universities* (pp. 5–21). Oxford: Routledge
- Salkind, N. (2010). Convenience sampling. In N. J. Salkind (Ed.), *Encyclopedia of Research Design*. (pp. 254–255). Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE Publications
- Settles, I. H. (2004). When Multiple Identities Interfere: The Role of Identity Centrality. *Personality and Social Psychology Bulletin*, 30(4), 487–500. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0146167203261885>
- Silova, I., & M. Bray. (2006). The private tutoring phenomenon: International patterns and perspectives. In I. Silova, M. Bray, and V. Budiene (Eds.), *Education in a hidden marketplace: Monitoring of private tutoring* (pp. 27–40). Open Society Institute
- Silova, I. (2009). Private supplementary tutoring: New burdens and opportunities. Paris: UNESCO International Institute for Educational Planning

- Silova, I. (2010). Private tutoring in Eastern Europe and Central Asia: policy choices and implications. *Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education*, 40(3), 327–344. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03057920903361926>
- Stets, J. E., & Burke, P. J. (2003). A sociological approach to self and identity. In M. Leary & J. Tangney (Eds.), *Handbook of self and identity* (pp. 128–152). Guilford Press
- Stryker, S., & Burke, P. J. (2000). The Past, Present, and Future of an Identity Theory. *Social Psychology Quarterly*, 63(4), 284. <https://doi.org/10.2307/2695840>
- Tajfel, H. (1978). Social categorization, social identity, and social comparison. In H. Tajfel (Ed.), *Differentiation between social groups: Studies in the social psychology of intergroup relations* (pp. 61–76). London: Academic Press
- Teo, P., & Koh, D. (2019). Shadow education in Singapore: A Deweyan perspective. *Educational Philosophy and Theory*, 52(8), 869–879. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00131857.2019.1700500>
- Teng, F. (2019). *Autonomy, Agency, and Identity in Teaching and Learning English as a Foreign Language*. Springer.
- the World Bank. (2018). *Uzbekistan Education Sector Analysis*. Retrieved from <http://documents.worldbank.org/curated/en/379211551844192053/Uzbekistan-Education-Sector-Analysis>
- United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization [UNESCO]. (2019). *Current Education Priorities and Concerns*. Retrieved from http://www.ibe.unesco.org/fileadmin/user_upload/archive/Countries/WDE/2006/ASIA_and_the_PACIFIC/Uzbekistan/Uzbekistan.htm
- Xiong, T., Li, Q., & Hu, G. (2020). Teaching English in the shadow: identity construction of private English language tutors in China. *Discourse: Studies in the Cultural Politics of Education*, 1–13. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01596306.2020.1805728>
- Yamato, Y., & Zhang, W. (2017). Changing schooling, changing shadow: shapes and functions of juku in Japan. *Asia Pacific Journal of Education*, 37(3), 329–343. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02188791.2017.1345719>
- Yung, K., & Bray, M. (2017). *Shadow education: Features, expansion and implications*. In T. Tse & M. Lee, (Eds.), *Making sense of education in post-handover Hong Kong: Achievements and challenges* (pp. 95–111). Routledge
- Zhan, S., Bray, M., Wang, D., Lykins, C., & Kwo, O. (2013). The effectiveness of private tutoring: students' perceptions in comparison with mainstream schooling in Hong Kong. *Asia Pacific Education Review*, 14(4), 495–509. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s12564-013-9276-7>